Fruit and vegetable intake and risk of wheezing and asthma: a systematic review and meta-analysis

Ensiyeh Seyedrezazadeh, Masoud Pour Moghaddam, Khalil Ansarin, Mohammad Reza Vafa, Sangita Sharma, and Fariba Kolahdooz

Major bibliographic databases were searched for studies examining the relationship between fruit and vegetable consumption and the risk of wheezing and asthma. Random-effects models were used to pool study results. Subgroup analyses were conducted by fruit and vegetable categories, study design, and age group. Twelve cohorts, 4 population-based case-control studies, and 26 cross-sectional studies published between January 1990 and July 2013 were identified. For the meta-analysis of adults and children, the relative risk (RR) and confidence intervals (CI) when comparing the highest intake group with the lowest intake group were 0.78 (95%Cl, 0.70–0.87) for fruit and 0.86 (95%Cl, 0.75–0.98) for vegetables. High intake of fruit and vegetables (RR = 0.76; 95%Cl, 0.68–0.86 and RR = 0.83; 95%Cl, 0.72–0.96) reduced the risk of childhood wheezing. Total intake of fruit and vegetables had a negative association with risk of asthma in adults and children (RR = 0.54; 95%Cl, 0.41-0.69). Consuming fruit and vegetables during pregnancy had no association with the risk of asthma in offspring. High intake of fruit and vegetables may reduce the risk of asthma and wheezing in adults and children. © 2014 International Life Sciences Institute

INTRODUCTION

During the past few decades, the prevalence of asthma and the morbidity and mortality associated with this condition have increased worldwide.¹ Asthma is characterized mainly by chronic airway inflammation that adversely affects normal lung function.^{1–3} A causal relationship for the development of asthma has not been established; however, interactions between genetic and environmental factors, including diet, are believed to cause sensitivity to allergic diseases. Diet may be a modifiable factor in predisposing individuals to asthma.^{1,4} For example, high intakes of salt,⁵ a change in the fatty acids component of the diet,⁶ and low intakes of fruit and vegetables^{7,8} have been related to the development of obstructive lung diseases.

High intake of flavone and flavanone was associated with a lower incidence of asthma.⁹ Although flavonoids are considered non-nutritive compounds, many have antioxidant, anti-inflammatory, anticancer, and gastro-, cardio-, and neuro-protective properties, which has led to increased interest in their potential role in the prevention of some chronic diseases.¹⁰⁻¹³ High intake of flavonoids such as quercetin, hesperitin, and naringenin has also been associated with a lower risk of asthma.^{9,14} Quercetin, which is present in apples, has anti-inflammatory and

Affiliations: *E Seyedrezazadeh* is with the Tuberculosis and Lung Research Disease Center, Tabriz University of Medical Sciences, Tabriz, Iran, and the School of Public Health, Iran University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. *M Pour Moghaddam* is with Northwest Health, 15 Homespace, Tamworth, NSW, Australia. *K Ansarin* is with the Tuberculosis and Lung Research Disease Center, Tabriz University of Medical Sciences, Tabriz, Iran. *M Pour Moghaddam* is with Northwest Health, 15 Homespace, Tamworth, NSW, Australia. *K Ansarin* is with the Tuberculosis and Lung Research Disease Center, Tabriz University of Medical Sciences, Tabriz, Iran. *MR Vafa* is with the School of Public Health, Iran University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. *S Sharma* and *F Kolahdooz* are with the Aboriginal and Global Health Research Group, Department of Medicine, Faculty of Medicine and Dentistry, University of Alberta, Edmonton, Alberta, Canada.

Correspondence: *Fariba Kolahdooz*, Aboriginal and Global Health Research Group, Department of Medicine, Faculty of Medicine and Dentistry, University of Alberta, Unit 5-10 University Terrace, 8303-112 Street, Edmonton, Alberta, Canada T6G 2T4. E-mail: fariba.kolahdooz@ualberta.ca. Phone: +1-780-492-3214. Fax: +1-780-492-3018.

Key words: asthma, fruit, vegetables, wheezing

doi:10.1111/nure.12121 Nutrition Reviews® antioxidant capacities and is widely ingested.^{15,16} Increasing evidence from cell and animal studies shows that flavonoids have a direct effect on signaling cascades involved in inflammatory cell responses.^{17,18}

Understanding dietary effects on wheezing and asthma may aid in the prevention of these chronic diseases. Therefore, a meta-analysis of published epidemiological studies was performed to clarify the relationship between consumption of fruit and vegetables and the risk of wheezing and/or asthma. It was hypothesized that the consumption of fruit and vegetables would be negatively associated with the risk of wheezing and asthma.

METHODS

A systematic review was conducted according to the MOOSE (meta-analysis of observational studies in epidemiology) guidelines.¹⁹ Using the Medline/PubMed, Embase, Cinahl, and Scopus databases, an extensive search was conducted of literature published in English between January 1990 and July 2013 and involving humans. The following key words and medical subject heading (MeSH) were included: asthma [MeSH] or lung function [MeSH] or asthma symptom and/or fruit [MeSH] and/or vegetables. Additional studies were identified from the reference list of selected articles and the Science Citation Index. Two authors extracted data independently (ES, MPM) and two authors (FK, ES) independently performed the quality assessment. To ensure uniformity, a single author checked the extracted data and validity criteria against the original published report. Abstracts of all identified studies were read, and irrelevant papers were excluded. The full texts of the remaining articles were reviewed to determine whether they met the criteria of the proposed study. Studies that met the following criteria were included in the meta-analysis: 1) the study was prospective, case-control, or crosssectional; 2) fruit and/or vegetable intake was the exposure investigated; 3) the outcome was asthma, asthma symptoms, and/or wheezing; 4) the odds ratio or the relative risk (RR) and the corresponding 95% confidence intervals (CIs) were reported. If the data were duplicated in more than one study, the most recent and complete study was included in the meta-analysis. Data drawn from the literature included the type of study, the country in which the study was performed, sex and age of participants, sample sizes, outcomes, and potential confounders, such as duration of the study and type and amount of fruit and vegetables consumed.

A meta-regression model was used to assess the association between fruit and vegetable intake and risk of wheezing and/or asthma. This analysis was performed for the total number of adults and children together, for the adults and the children separately, and for pregnant

from a specific risk factor, the risk estimate from each study, weighted by the inverse of variance, was pooled. First, a fixed-effects model was used. When significant levels were obtained, the random-effects models of DerSimonian²⁰ were applied, which consider both withinand between-type study variations. Sensitivity analysis was conducted to examine whether the inclusion criteria affected the pooled estimates.^{21,22} Cochran's test for heterogeneity was used to determine whether the studies included in the meta-analysis evaluated the same underlying sizes of the effect.²³ A threshold of P < 0.1 was used to identify the presence of heterogeneity (genuine variation in effect sizes). I^2 (an estimate of the proportion of total observed variability due to genuine variation rather than random error within studies) was used to quantify the degree of inconsistency between studies and was considered substantial when I^2 was >50%.²⁴ As recommended in the MOOSE guidelines, analyses were stratified by key features of the study design to assess the effects on the results.¹⁹ Furthermore, using subgroup analysis, considering for confounding factors and effect modifiers was employed using the recommendations of Nurmatov et al.²⁵ Primary confounding factors, which considered general characteristics (including age and sex), socioeconomic status (including education and income), environmental factors (such as smoking), and dietary factors, were taken into account. In the sensitivity analyses, secondary confounding factors were also accounted for, specifically physical activity.25 Statistical analyses were performed with Stata statistical software version 9.1 (Stata Corp., College Station, TX, USA).

women. To examine the risk of wheezing and/or asthma

RESULTS

The literature search identified 334 potentially relevant publications. After screening the titles and abstracts, 259 were excluded because they were irrelevant or were review articles. The process of study selection is shown in Figure 1. Seventy-six articles were retrieved for further review, of which 34 were excluded. Of the studies excluded, 13 evaluated diet patterns and risk of asthma using factor analysis.²⁶⁻³⁸ Another 4 were randomized controlled trials,³⁹⁻⁴² of which 1 investigated the effects of a mixture of fruit, vegetables, fish oil, and probiotics supplement,⁴¹ 1 compared the effects of high intake of vegetables and fruit with low intake,⁴² 1 studied lycopene extract from tomato,40 and 1 investigated the effect of purple passion fruit peel extract on pulmonary function parameters.³⁹ Five studies reported RRs for the lowest versus the highest intake of fruit and vegetables,^{7,8,43-45} 1 considered only supplement use,⁴⁶ 2 reported the association of fruit intake and forced expiratory volume in 1 second,^{47,48} 1 reported exposure to birch/grass pollen and



Figure 1 Summary of screening process to identify studies for meta-analysis.

tree-nuts of at 1 or 2 years and asthma symptoms at 4 years of age,⁴⁹ 2 did not provide sufficient information to allow the calculation of CIs,^{38,50} and 1 investigated the effect of nutrition education programs on attitudes, beliefs, and behaviors related to fruit and vegetable consumption.⁵¹ Two studies investigated the influence of asthma status on fruit and vegetable intake,^{52,53} and 3 others assessed the effect of fruit and vegetable intake on allergic responses.^{54–56}

Forty-two articles fulfilled the inclusion criteria. Table 1 shows the main characteristics of the studies evaluated, including 12 cohort studies,^{9,57–67} 4 populationbased case-control studies,^{68–71} and 26 cross-sectional studies.^{72–97} Overall, 93,575 subjects with 11.5 years of follow-up were included from cohort studies, 1,367 cases and 1,833 controls from case-control studies, and 958,457 participants from cross-sectional studies. The International Study of Asthma and Allergies in Childhood questionnaire was used to elicit self-reported respiratory symptoms in studies on children and adolescents.^{59,60,64–66,70,73,77–81,83,84,86,89–91} A validated food frequency questionnaire was used for dietary assessment in 23 studies,^{59,61,65–68,72,75–77,81,82,84–88,90,91,93,95–97} and a dietary habits questionnaire or food diaries were used in 19 studies.^{9,57,58,60,62,64,69-71,73,74,78-80,83,89,92}

RRs from studies that examined an association between fruit and vegetable consumption and wheezing and/or asthma in the total number of adults and children and in subgroup analyses of children were pooled. Furthermore, analyses were performed to determine the association between maternal fruit and vegetable intake during pregnancy and the risk of asthma in offspring.

Adults and children

Fruit and vegetable intake and risk of wheezing. Two cohort studies^{58,65} and 13 cross-sectional studies^{73,77–81,84–87,90,91,96} evaluated the association between fruit intake and different descriptions of wheezing, including wheeze, wheezy illness, severe wheeze, shortness of breath with wheeze, severe wheeze with atopy, and exercise-related wheeze (Table 2). A strong negative association was found between high fruit intake and wheezing (RR = 0.81; 95%CI, 0.74–0.88), with significant heterogeneity confirmed among included studies (*P* for heterogeneity <0.0001, $I^2 = 81.9\%$) (Figure 2A). A sensitivity

vegetable i	ntake and ri	sk of asthma and wh	ieezing.						
Reference	Country	Food measured	Study population	Age	Follow-up (y)	Basis for asthma diagnosis	Method of dietary evaluation	Values or variables contrasted	Adjustments applied
Cohort studie Miedema et al. (1993) ⁵⁷	ss Netherlands	Total fruit & solid fruit	793 males	40–59 y	25	Episodes of respiratory symptoms doctor cliannosis	Dietary history	Quartile 4 vs. quartile 1	Age, BMI, energy, smoking
Butland et al. (1999) ⁵⁸	United Kingdom	Fresh fruit	5,582 males & 5,770 females	0-33 y	23	Wheezing/whistling in the chest in the past doctor	Validated questionnaires	>1 time/wk vs. never	Sex, smoking, social class, vegetable intake
Knekt et al. (2002) ⁹	Finland	Orange, apple, grapefruit, onion, white cabbage,	382 (males & females)	30–69 y	20	Questionnaire	Dietary history	Quartile 4 vs. quartile 1	Sex, age
Willers et al. (2007) ⁵⁹	Netherlands	Total fruit, citrus/kiwi, apples, fruit juice, total vegetables, & green leafy vegetables	1,212 (mothers & their children)	At birth	Ś	ISAAC questionnaire	О́ Ш	>4 times/wk vs. 0–1 time/wk	Maternal age of leaving full-time education, paternal social class, maternal age and smoking during pregnancy, smoking in the home during childhood, energy, maternal asthma and/or atopy, birth weight, presence of older siblings, sex of child horeactfeeding,
Willers et al. (2008) ⁶⁰	Netherlands	Fruit & vegetables	2,832 (mothers & their children)	3 mo-8 y	ω	ISAAC questionnaire	Questionnaire about mother's & child's diets	Daily vs. rare intake	Sex, maternal education, parential appy, maternal smoking during pregnancy, smoking in the house at age 8 years, breast feeding, presence of older siblings, birth weight, overweight mother, maternal supplement use during pregnancy without folic acid and iron, region, intervention or natural history study oroup
Chatzi et al. (2008) ⁶¹	Spain	Vegetables	507 mothers & 468 children	6.5 y	6.5	Questionnaire about wheeze, whistling, and skin-prick test	FFQ	Weekly or daily consumption vs. never	Gender, parental asthma, maternal social class and education, BMI, energy intake at age 6.5 years

Table 1 Cohort studies, population-based case-control studies, and cross-sectional studies included in the meta-analysis of the associations between fruit and

	Sex, heredity, hay fever, smoking, gastro- oesophageal reflux, snoring, physical activity, building dampness, socioeconomic group, RMI	Maternal age, gestation at baseline, education, history of asthma, maternal smoking during pregnancy, age of infant at third survey.	Sex, maternal educational, parental atopy, maternal smoking during pregnancy, smoking in the house at 8 years of age, breast feeding, presence of older siblings, birth weight, overweight mother, overweight child at 8 years of age, geographical region and	Sex, place of birth, duration of gestation, maternal age at delivery, maternal basic education, smoking during pregnancy, mode of delivery, number of siblings at the time of the child's birth, parental asthma, parental allergic rhinitis, atopic eczema by 6 months of age, pets at home by 1 year of age, duration of breastfeeding, and day-care at 1 year of age
Daily consumption vs. never	Daily consumption vs. never	Quartile 4 vs. quartile 1	1 time/wk vs. long-term intake from age 2 to 8 y	Highest vs. lowest quintile
Validated questionnaire	Questionnaire about frequency of current consumption	рно	Annual FFQ	Q
Questionnaire about family history of atopy, detailed information on asthma & doctor-diagnosed	Questionnaire	ISAAC questionnaire	ISAAC questionnaire	ISAAC questionnaire
18	13	2	٥	Ś
At birth	16 y, 30–39 y, & 60–69 y	16–24 mo	2–3 y & 7–8 y	0-5 y
2,133 (males & females)	8,066 (males & females)	50,004 (mothers & their children)	2,870 (mothers & their children)	2,441 (mothers & their children)
Fruit & vegetables	Fruit	Total fruit, citrus fruit, apples, total vegetables, green, yellow, and other vegetables	Fresh fruit & cooked vegetables	Fruit & vegetables
Greece	Sweden	Japan	Netherlands	Finland
Bacopoulou et al. (2009) ⁶²	Uddenfeldt et al. (2010) ⁶³	Miyake et al. (2010) ⁶⁴	Willers et al. (2011) ⁶⁵	Erkkola et al. (2012) ⁶⁶

Table 1 Cont i	inued								
Reference	Country	Food measured	Study population	Age	Follow-up (y)	Basis for asthma diagnosis	Method of dietary evaluation	Values or variables contrasted	Adjustments applied
Protudjer et al. (2012) ⁶⁷	Canada	Fruit & vegetables	476 (males & females)	8-10 y & 11-1	14 y 6	Skin-prick test ≥3 mm & asthma symptoms	FFQ	Low vs. high score	 Breastfeeding, fast food consumption, weight, region of residence, income, physical activity, maternal history of activia
Population b Shaheen et al. (2001) ⁶⁸	ased case-cont . United Kingdom	trol studies Apples & onions	607 cases & 864 controls	16–50 y	I	Questionnaire	FFQ	Apples, onions: 25 times/wk compared with	vitamin C and β-carotene intake
Patel el al. (2006) ⁶⁹	United Kingdom	Fruit & vegetables	515 cases & 515 controls	45-75 y	I	Doctor-diagnosed asthma	7-day food diaries	 <oncer li="" month<=""> Higher consumption than median intake vs. no consumption </oncer>	Smoking, social class, BMI, physical activity, education
Pastorino et al.	Brazil	Fresh fruit & cooked vegetables	141 cases & 387 controls	13–14 y	I	ISAAC questionnaire	Questionnaire about dietary habite	Weekly or daily vs. no	Allergic mother, skin prick test, eczema, rhinitis and
ر2011) ⁷⁷ (2011) ⁷⁷	Brazil	Fruit & vegetables	104 cases & 67 controls	2-1 y	T	Questionnaire	Dietary data collected during the last 30 days	Regular vs. occasional consumption	Prenatury Race, sex, mechanical ventilation during neonatal period, age at onset of the disease, parental education, household income, presence of pets, family history of allergic rhinitis, exposure to maternal smoking, exclusive breastfeeding, obesity, regulat consumption of feach or and
Cross-sectior La Vecchia et al.	ial studies Italy	Vegetables	46,693 (males & females)	≥15 y	I	Questionnaire	FFQ	Highest vs. lowest tertile	: Alcohol, smoking, age, sex, education
(1998) ²² Forastiere et al. (2000) ⁷³	Italy	Citrus/kiwi fruit	18,737 (males & females)	6–7 y	I	ISAAC questionnaire	Questionnaire on dietary habits, citrus fruit consumption	5–7 times/wk vs. <1 time/wk	Sex, study area, father's education, household density, parental smoking, dampness or mould, parental asthma

Priftanji et al. (2002) ⁷⁴ Ushiyama	Albania Japan	Fruit or vegetables Fruit & vegetables	2,653 (males & females) 2,070 (mothers &	20–44 y <12 mo	1 1	Questionnaire Doctor diagnoses	Questionnaire on dietary habits FFQ	At least once/wk Portion sizes	Age, sex, smoking Family history of asthma,
et al. (2002) ⁷⁵			their children)					(øu kcal)	sex, order of birtin, age
Woods et al. (2003) ⁷⁶	Australia	Fruit & vegetables	1,601 (males & females)	20-44 y	I	ECRHS questionnaire	FFQ	1–2 pieces apples, pears, and berries/day; 2–4 servings leafy greens & tomatoes/day	Age, sex, smoking, BMI, region of birth, family history of asthma, and energy intake
Farchi et al. (2003) ⁷⁷	Italy	Fresh fruit, citrus fruit, kiwi, cooked vegetables, salads, tomatoes, & peppers	5,257 (boys & girls)	6–7 y	I	ISAAC questionnaire	FFQ	>4 times/wk vs. never	Sex, study area, paternal education, paternal smoking, parental asthma, dampness or mould in the child's room, household crowding
Awasthi et al. (2004) ⁷⁸	India	Fruit & vegetables	3,000 (boys & girls)	13–14 y	1	ISAAC questionnaire	Validated questionnaire	Fruit: ≥3 times/d Vegetables: ≥1 time/wk	Mother's education, antibiotic use in the first year of life, eating pasta or fast-food or meat ≥1/wk, exercise ≥1/wk
Wong et al. (2004) ⁷⁹	China	Fruit & vegetables	10,902 (boys & girls)	10 y	I	ISAAC questionnaire	Validated questionnaire	Fruit: ≥1 time/day Vegetable: ≥1 time/wk	Propensity score, sex
Nja et al. (2005) ⁸⁰	Norway	Fruit & vegetables	4,585 (boys & girls)	6–16 y	1	ISAAC questionnaire	Validated questionnaire	Daily consumption vs. less than once/wk	Age, sex, area, parental education, parental atopy, exposure to dog and cat, mothers' smoking during pregnancy or first year after delivery
Tabak et al. (2006) ⁸¹	Germany	Citrus fruit & vegetables	598 (boys & girls)	8–13 y	I	ISAAC questionnaire	FFQ	Highest vs. lowest tertile	Mother's education, foreign descent, energy intake
Romieu et al. (2006) ⁸²	France	Fruit, citrus fruit, apples, leafy vegetables, fruity vegetables, ^a tomatoes, root vegetables, ^b carrots, & cabbage	68,535 females	40–65 y	1	ATS questionnaire	FFQ	Quartile 4 vs. quartile 1	Age, energy intake, BMI, physical activity, smoking, menopausal status, vitamin supplementation use
Garcia-Marcos et al. (2007) ⁸³	Spain	Fruit & vegetables	20,106 (boys & girls)	6-7 y	I	ISAAC questionnaire	Validated questionnaire	≥3 times/wk vs. once or twice/wk	Sex, obesity, maternal smoking, number of siblings and physical activity

Reference	Country	Food measured	Study population	Age	Follow-up (y)	Basis for asthma diagnosis	Method of dietary evaluation	Values or variables contrasted	Adjustments applied
Okoko et al. (2007) ⁸⁴	United Kingdom	Fresh apples, apple juice, bananas, & other fruit	2,640 (boys & girls)	5-10 y	1	ISAAC questionnaire	Q	>1 serving/day vs.<1 serving/mo	Sex, age, paracetamol exposure, ibuprofen use, supplement use, lived on a farm, mould or mildew in house, finance support, exposure to passive smoking, ethnicity, birth weight, breastfeeding, number of parents living with child, number of children at home, parental education
Chatzi et al. (2007) ⁸⁵	Spain	Fruit, vegetables, & fruitv vegetables	460 (boys & girls)	6.5 y	I	Questionnaire	FFQ	Highest vs. Iowest tertile	Energy intake
Chatzi et al. (2007) ⁸⁶	Crete	Fruit & vegetables	690 (boys & girls)	7–18 y	I	ISAAC questionnaire & family history of allergic disease	FFQ	>1 time/day vs. <1 time/day	Age, sex, BMI, parental asthma, number of older siblings
Tsai & Tsai (2007) ⁸⁷	Taiwan	Fruit & vegetables	2,218 (boys & girls)	11–12 y	I	ATS questionnaire	FFQ	Daily intake vs. never	Residential districts, gender, physician-diagnosed allergy
Barros et al. (2008) ⁸⁸	Portugal	Fruit & vegetables	174 (males & females)	>16 y	1	Doctor diagnosis	FFQ	Fruit: >304.97 g/ day vs. <17.51 g/day; Vegetables: >426.63 g/day vs. <211.54 g/ day	Gender, age, education, energy intake and corticosteroid use
Garcia et al. (2008) ⁸⁹	Colombia	Fruit	3,256 children & 3,829 adolescents	6–7 y and 13–14 y	I	ISAAC questionnaire	Questionnaire on dietary habits	≥3 times/wk vs. occasionally	Acetaminophen and antibiotic use, TV watching, maternal education, presence of cat at home
Takaoka & Norback (2008) ⁹⁰	Japan	Fruit, fruit juice, raw vegetables, & cooked vegetables	153 females	Mean, 21 y	I	ISAAC/ECRHS questionnaires, doctor-diagnosed asthma	FFQ	Almost daily vs. never	Age, smoking, parental asthma/allergy, all food items studies
Nagel et al. (2010) ⁹¹	20 countries ^c	Fruit, fruit juice, raw vegetables, & cooked vegetables	50,004 (boys & girls)	8–12 y	I	ISAAC questionnaire	FFQ	≥3 times/wk vs. never/ occasionally	Age, sex, smoking exposure, parental atopy, exercise and number of siblings

Age, sex, ethnicity, and socioeconomic status	Sex, socioeconomic status, maternal smoking during pregnancy and/or at baseline, BMI, maternal age at baseline, and parental history of allergic disease	Age, sex, BMI, breastfeeding, history of food allergy, mother's age, parental history of allergy, maternal education level, the number of siblings and household smoking	Age, education, weight status, physical activity, and smoking status	2	Age, sex, marital status, education, employment status, religion, geographic region, environmental factors, BMI, smoking status, alcohol, TV watching, other dietary factors	story questionnaire; ECRHS, od questionnaire.
High vs. low consumption	Highest vs. lowest : tertile	Highest vs. lowest tertile	Quintile 5 vs. quartile 1	≥3 times/wk vs. never	Daily intake vs. never/ occasionally	mass index; DHQ, diet hi and Allergies in Childho
Validated questionnaire	Q	3-day dietary record	FFQ	FFQ	FQ	ood Institute; BMI, body ational Study of Asthma
Doctor diagnosis; wheeze or cough during or after active play; dry cough at night without a cold; visit to doctor, ER, or hospital for wheezing	At least 4 episodes of wheezing in the last year or at least 1 episode of wheezing during the same period in combination with prescribed inhaled steroids used occasionally or regularly	ATS-DLD questionnaire	Questionnaire & self-reported information	ISAAC questionnaire	Questionnaire	National Heart, Lung, and Blc questionnaire; ISAAC, Intern.
I	I	1	I	I	I	g Diseases of the Q, food frequency zucchini.
11–15 y	8	3–6 y	≥45 years	6–7 y and 13–14 y	20-49 y	d Division of Lun ergency room; FF- bell pepper, and
4,726 (boys & girls)	2,447 (boys & girls)	452 (boys & girls)	156,035 (males & females)	246,545 adolescents & 143,775 children	99,574 females & 56,742 males	can Thoracic Society an questionnaire; ER, eme reen beans, eggplants, l
Vegetables	Fruit (total fruit, apple, citrus, bananas), vegetables (total vegetables, onions, carrots, tomatoes, cruciferous, & green vegetables)	Fruit & vegetables	Fruit & vegetables	 Fruit & vegetables 	Fruit & vegetables	racic Society; ATS-DLD, Ameri ttory Health Survey screening cado, tomatoes, cucumber, g ot, celeriac, and salsify. C Phase II). AC Phase II).
Canada	Sweden	Japan	Australia	51 countries ⁶	India	S, American Thoi mmunity Respira es: artichoke, avo s: carrots, beetro countries (ISAA 1 countries (ISA)
Lawson et al. (2011) ⁹²	Rosenlund et al. (2011) ⁹³	Nakamura et al. (2012) ⁹⁴	Rosenkranz et al. (2012) ⁹⁵	Ellwood et al. (2013) ⁹⁶	Agrawal et al. (2013) ⁹⁷	Abbreviations: AT the European Co ^a Fruity vegetable ^b Root vegetablei ^c 29 centers in 20 ^d 107 centers in 5

Population and analysis type	Pooled effect estimate (95%Cl)	P heterogeneity	 ²	No. of studies
Adults and children				
Wheeze and fruit				
Overall	0.81 (0.74–0.88)	<0.0001	81.9%	15
By type of study	0.06 (0.04, 1.10)	0.20	0.00/	2
Cohort	0.96 (0.84–1.10)	0.38	0.0%	2
Cross-sectional	0.79 (0.72–0.86)	<0.0001	84.1%	13
	0.64 (0.42, 0.98)	0.03	71 00%	2 (CS)
Apples Citrus fruit	0.64 (0.42-0.98)	0.03	71.9%	2 (CS) A (CS)
Wheere and vegetables	0.08 (0.00-0.70)	0.20	JJ. 270	4 (C3)
Overall	0.89 (0.81-0.98)	<0.0001	82.5%	11
By type of study	0.05 (0.01 0.50)		02.070	
Cohort	1.22 (1.04–1.44)	_	_	1
Cross-sectional	0.86 (0.78–0.94)	<0.0001	81.1%	10
Subgroup analysis				
Tomatoes	0.50 (0.35–0.70)	0.20	40.1%	2 (CS)
Peppers	0.64 (0.32-1.31)	0.52	0.0%	2 (CS)
Asthma and fruit				
Overall	0.84 (0.80-0.90)	<0.0001	70.0%	23
By type of study				
Cohort	0.78 (0.66–0.92)	0.02	65.1%	5
Population based case-control	0.71 (0.60–0.85)	0.65	0.0%	4
Cross-sectional	0.84 (0.83–0.94)	<0.0001	69.5%	14
Subgroup analysis	0.04 (0.70, 0.01)	0.05	F2 00/	7 (1
Apples	0.84 (0.78–0.91)	0.05	52.8%	/ (T CONOFL, Z
Citrus fruit	0.86 (0.78–0.96)	0.04	60.7%	5 (1 cohort, 1
Asthma and fruit and vegetables				rcc, allu 5 CS)
Overall	0.64(0.41 - 1.01)	<0.0001	86 5%	4
By type of study	0.01 (0.11 1.01)	<0.0001	00.570	т
Cohort	0.60 (0.40–0.90)	_	_	1
Cross-sectional	0.65 (0.37–0.1.16)	<0.0001	88.1%	3
Asthma and vegetables				
Overall	0.88 (0.82-0.95)	<0.0001	83.8%	18
By type of study				
Cohort	0.77 (0.35–1.69)	0.004	88.2%	2
Population-based case-control	0.80 (0.43-1.48)	0.03	72.3%	3
Cross-sectional	0.87 (0.81-0.94)	<0.0001	86.1%	13
Atopy and fruit	0.98 (0.95–1.01)	0.53	0.0%	3 (CS)
Atopy and vegetables	0.99 (0.96–1.01)	0.44	0.0%	3 (CS)
Adults				
Wheeze and fruit	0.69 (0.49–0.96)	0.27	17.5%	2
Overall				
By type of study	0.01 (0.52, 1.22)			1
Cohort	0.81 (0.53–1.22)	-	-	1
Cross-sectional	0.57 (0.36–0.90)	-	-	1
Asthman and fruit	1.2 (0.86-1.67)	-	-	
	0.77 (0.68–0.87)	<0.0001	84.4%	9
Overall By type of study				
Cohort	0.71 (0.61, 0.92)	0.27	22.00/	2
Population-based case-control	0.71(0.01-0.02) 0.72(0.60, 0.87)	0.27	25.0%	2 2
Cross-sectional	0.72 (0.00-0.07)	<0.70	0.070 85 10%	∠
Subaroun analysis	0.07 (0.70-1.002)	<0.000T	05.170	4
Annles	0 77 (0 66–0 90)	0.02	66 1%	5 (1 cohort 2
(ippics	0.77 (0.00 0.70)	0.02	00.170	P(C and 2CS)
Citrus fruit	0.76 (0.56-1.02)	0.01	76.9%	3 (1 cohort. 1
				PCC, and 1 CS)
Asthma and vegetables Overall	0.84 (0.74–0.96)	<0.0001	92.7%	6

Table 2 Meta-analysis of the association between fruit and vegetable intake and risk of wheezing and asthma in
studies in adults and children, in children, and in pregnant women.

Population and analysis type	Pooled effect estimate (95%Cl)	P heterogeneity	l ²	No. of studies
By type of study				
Population-based case-control	0.88 (0.62-1.25)	_	-	1
Cross-sectional	0.84 (0.73-0.97)	<0.0001	94.2%	5
Children				
Wheeze and fruit				
Overall	0.81 (0.74–0.88)	<0.0001	83.1%	14
By type of study				
Cohort	0.98 (0.86–1.12)	_	_	1
Cross-sectional	0.79 (0.72-0.86)	<0.0001	84.2%	13
Subgroup analysis				
Apples	0.64 (0.42-0.98)	0.03	71.9%	2(CS)
Citrus fruit	0.69(0.61-0.77)	0.22	32.3%	4 (CS)
Wheeze and vegetables		0.22	32.370	1 (00)
Overall	0 88 (0 79–0 97)	<0.0001	83.7%	10
By type of study	0.00 (0.75 0.57)	<0.0001	05.770	10
Cohort	1.22(1.04 - 1.44)	_	_	1
Cross-sectional	0.84 (0.76 - 0.93)	~0.0001	82.4%	0
Subgroup applysis	0.84 (0.70-0.95)	<0.0001	02.470	9
	0.50 (0.35, 0.70)	0.10	10 1%	2(CS)
Dopporc	0.50(0.55-0.70) 0.64(0.22, 1.21)	0.19	40.1%	2 (CS)
Acthmo and fruit	0.04 (0.32-1.31)	0.32	0.0%	2 (C3)
	0.00 (0.86, 0.04)	0.21	24 50/	10
Overall Distance of study	0.90 (0.86–0.94)	0.21	24.5%	12
By type of study	0.00 (0.83, 0.00)	0.55	0.00/	h
Conort Demulation based area control	0.90 (0.83–0.99)	0.55	0.0%	2
Population-based case-control	0.51 (0.23–1.16)	0.36	0.0%	2
Cross-sectional	0.90 (0.85–0.95)	0.13	38.2%	8
Asthma and fruit and vegetables		0.60	0.00/	2
Overall	0.57 (0.42–0.77)	0.69	0.0%	2
By type of study				
Cohort	0.60 (0.40–0.90)	-	-	1
Cross-sectional	0.53 (0.33–0.84)	-	-	1
Asthma and vegetables				
Overall	0.91 (0.82–1.00)	<0.0001	69.2%	12
By type of study				
Cohort	0.77 (0.35–1.69)	0.004	88.2%	2
Population-based case-control	0.73 (0.20–2.66)	0.01	85.9%	2
Cross-sectional	0.91 (0.83–0.99)	0.02	57.9%	8
Pregnant women				
Wheeze and fruit	0.94 (0.0.73–1.27)	0.02	70.2%	4 cohort
Wheeze and apples	0.84 (0.48–1.46)	0.06	71.8%	2 cohort
Wheeze and vegetables	0.91 (0.70–1.18)	0.05	61.0%	4 cohort
Asthma and fruit				
Overall	0.94 (0.81-1.08)	0.84	0.0%	3
By type of study				
Cohort	0.92 (0.78-1.08)	0.81	0.0%	2
Cross-sectional	1.01(0.74–1.38)	-	-	1
Asthma and vegetables	- · ·			
Overall	1.06 (0.72-1.58)	0.05	67.4%	3
By type of study				
Cohort	0.95 (0.81–1.12)	0.31	5.0%	2
Cross-sectional	1.80 (1.06–3.20)	-	_	1

Table 2 Continued

Abbreviations: CS, cross-sectional study; PCC, population-based case-control study.

analysis performed by excluding the three types of wheezing (severe wheeze with allergic sensitization atopy, severe wheeze, and exercise-related wheeze) in two studies^{73,80} produced similar results (RR = 0.83; 95%CI; 0.77–0.90). To ensure confounder and effect

modification²⁵ were properly accounted for, sensitivity analysis was performed by including studies that adjusted for both effect modification and at least two primary confounders (general characteristics, socioeconomic status, smoking, and physical activity). Further analysis found

a) Fruit intake and risk of wheezing



b) Vegetable intake and risk of wheezing



Figure 2 Forest plots of the association between intake of fruit (a) or vegetables (b) and risk of wheezing.

the association between fruit intake and wheezing was similar (RR = 0.81; 95%CI, 0.75–0.89; *P* for heterogeneity <0.0001, I^2 = 82.5%).

After stratifying by study type, there was a significant 24% reduction in risk for the cross-sectional studies, whereas results for cohort studies were null. There was also a significant negative association between high intake of apples and citrus fruit and reduced risk of wheezing (Table 2). There was a significant heterogeneity within studies for apple consumption (*P* for heterogeneity = 0.03, $I^2 = 71.9\%$), but not for citrus fruit (*P* for heterogeneity = 0.20, $I^2 = 35.2\%$).

The association between vegetable intake and risk of wheezing was examined in 1 cohort⁶⁵ and 10 populationbased cross-sectional studies (Table 2).^{77–79,81,85–87,90,91,96} Total raw and cooked vegetable consumption was correlated with a significant decrease in risk of wheezing (RR = 0.89; 95%CI, 0.81–0.98; *P* for heterogeneity <0.0001, $I^2 = 82.5\%$) (Figure 2B). Four studies^{65,77,90,91} reported inverse associations between cooked vegetables and wheezing, in which the pooled effect of a high intake of cooked vegetables was null (RR = 0.99; 95%CI, 0.81-1.22; P for heterogeneity = 0.027, $I^2 = 67.4\%$). A sensitivity analysis, performed by excluding these four studies, also showed raw vegetable consumption significantly decreased the risk of wheezing (RR = 0.70; 95%CI, 0.53-0.94; *P* for heterogeneity <0.0001, $I^2 = 79.3\%$). Furthermore, the sensitivity analysis showed no association between high vegetable intake and reduced risk of wheezing (RR = 0.92; 95%CI, 0.85–1.01; *P* for heterogeneity <0.0001, $I^2 = 82.1\%$). In the subgroup analysis, high tomato intake was negatively associated with the risk of

a) Fruit intake and risk of asthma

Study	RR (95% CI)
Cohort studies	
Miedema (1993) ⁵⁷	0.68 (0.54, 0.85)
Knekt $(2002)^9$	0.59 (0.43, 0.82)
Uddenfeldt $(2010)^{63}$	0.78 (0.66, 0.92)
Willers (2011) ⁶⁵	0.90 (0.82, 0.99)
Protudier $(2012)^{67}$	1.06 (0.63, 1.79)
	0.78 (0.66, 0.92); P for heterogeneity=0.022
Case control studies	
Shaheen (2001) ⁰⁶	0.68 (0.47, 0.98)
Patel (2006) ⁶⁹	0.74 (0.60, 0.92)
Pastorino (2006) ⁷⁰	0.31 (0.08, 1.21)
Mendes (2011) ⁷¹	0.68 (0.25, 1.89)
	0.71 (0.59, 0.85); P for heterogeneity=0.654
Cross sectional studies	
Woods (2003) ⁷⁶	0.99 (0.95, 1.03)
Nja (2005) ⁸⁰	0.53 (0.33, 0.84)
Romieu (2006) ⁸²	0.94 (0.88, 1.00)
Tabak (2006) ⁸¹	0.65 (0.37, 1.14)
Garcia-Marcos (2007) ⁸³	0.85 (0.69, 1.04)
Okoko (2007) ⁸⁴	0.88 (0.70, 1.11)
Tsai (2007) ⁸⁷	0.95 (0.91, 1.00)
Barros (2008) ⁸⁸	0.29 (0.10, 0.83)
Garcia (2008) ⁸⁹	0.60 (0.40, 1.00)
Nagel (2010) ⁹¹	0.88 (0.80, 0.96)
Rosenlund $(2011)^{93}$	1.12 (0.66, 1.87)
Nakamura (2012) ⁹⁴	0.61 (0.26, 1.48)
Ellwood (2013) ⁹⁶	0.88 (0.82, 0.94)
Agrawal (2013) ⁹⁷	0.59 (0.45, 0.77)
- · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	0.88 (0.83, 0.94); P for heterogeneity=0.000
Pooled (all studies)	0.84 (0.79, 0.89); P for heterogeneity=0.000
	10
.1 1	10

b) Vegetable intake and risk of asthma

Study RR (95% CI) **Cohort Studies** 1.10 (0.98, 1.24) 0.49 (0.29, 0.84) Willers (2011)65 Protudjer (2012)67 0.77 (0.35, 1.69); p for hetrogenity = 0.004 Case control studies $\begin{array}{c} 0.88 \ (0.62, \, 1.24) \\ 0.37 \ (0.18, \, 0.79) \\ 1.39 \ (0.74, \, 2.63) \end{array}$ Patel (2006)69 Pastorino (2006)70 Mendes (2011)71 0.80 (0.43, 1.48); p for hetrogenity = 0.027 **Cross sectional studies** 0.70 (0.61, 0.78) La Vecchia (1998)72 $\begin{array}{c} 1.00 & (0.98, 1.01) \\ 0.85 & (0.81, 0.90) \\ 1.24 & (0.69, 2.23) \end{array}$ Woods (2003) Romieu (2006)⁸² Tabak (2006)⁸¹ $\begin{array}{c} 1.24 \ (0.09, 2.23) \\ 1.00 \ (0.95, 1.05) \\ 0.78 \ (0.56, 1.11) \\ 0.93 \ (0.32, 2.70) \\ 0.86 \ (0.78, 0.95) \end{array}$ Tsai (2007)8 Garcia-Marcos (2007)⁸³ Barros (2008)⁸⁸ Nagel (2010)⁹¹ $\begin{array}{c} 0.36 \ (0.78, 0.93) \\ 0.68 \ (0.48, 0.96) \\ 0.94 \ (0.58, 1.54) \\ 0.51 \ (0.20, 1.32) \\ 0.92 \ (0.86, 0.99) \end{array}$ Lawson (2011)⁹² Rosenlund (2011)93 Nakamura (2012)⁹⁴ Ellwood (2013)⁹⁶ 0.79 (0.66, 0.93) Agrawal (2013)97 0.87 (0.81, 0.94); p for hetrogenity = 0.000) 0.88 (0.82, 0.95); p for hetrogenity = 0.000) .1 1 10



wheezing. The findings for high bell pepper intake, however, were null (Table 2).

Fruit and vegetable intake and risk of asthma. Metaanalysis of 5 prospective cohorts, 9,57,63,65,67 4 populationbased case-control studies, $^{68-71}$ and 14 cross-sectional studies, $^{76,80-84,87-89,91,93,94,96,97}$ that evaluated intake of fruit in relation to risk of asthma yielded a significant negative association. The overall RR was 0.84 (95%CI, 0.80–0.90) for the highest fruit intake group compared with the lowest intake group, with significant heterogeneity (*P* for heterogeneity <0.0001, $I^2 = 69.4\%$) (Table 2). A sensitivity analysis performed by excluding severe asthma in one study⁹⁶ produced similar results (RR = 0.84; 95%CI, 0.79– 0.9). Subgroup analysis by study design yielded a significant negative association between high fruit intake and risk of asthma among population-based case-control studies, cohort studies, and cross-sectional studies (Table 2, Figure 3A). When data were stratified by fruit type, the results remained statistically significant for both high intake of apples and for citrus fruit intake and risk of asthma (Table 2). Fruit and vegetable consumption in pregnant women and risk of wheezing or asthma in their children. Metaanalysis of 2 cohort studies,65,67 3 population-based case-control studies,⁶⁹⁻⁷¹ and 13 cross-sectional studies^{72,76,81-83,87,88,91-94,96,97} showed that high consumption of vegetables had a modest association with reduced risk of asthma (RR = 0.88; 95%CI, 0.82-0.95; P < 0.0001, $I^2 = 83.8$) (Figure 3B). A sensitivity analysis was performed by excluding 2 studies^{65,70} on cooked vegetables; there was a significant negative association between high raw vegetable consumption and risk of asthma (RR = 0.87; 95%CI, 0.81-0.94; P for heterogeneity) $<0.0001, I^2 = 84.1\%$). In subgroup analysis, a null inverse association was found between high vegetable intake and risk of asthma among cohort and population-based casecontrol studies but significant negative association was found among cross-sectional studies (Table 2).

High consumption of a mixture fruit and vegetables was significantly associated with a decreased risk of asthma (RR = 0.64; 95%CI, 0.41–1.01; *P* for heterogeneity< 0.0001, $I^2 = 86.5\%$).^{62,74,80,95}

Data from 3 cross-sectional studies^{76,85,86} showed no association between high intake of fruit (RR = 0.98; 95%CI, 0.95–1.01) or vegetables (RR = 0.99; 95% CI, 0.96– 1.01) and risk of atopy (Table 2).

Adults

Fruit and vegetable intake and risk of wheezing and asthma. One cohort study⁵⁸ and 1 cross-sectional study⁹⁰ that examined the association between fruit intake and risk of wheezing in adults showed a reduction in risk of asthma when highest versus lowest intakes were compared (RR = 0.68; 95%CI, 0.49–0.96; P for heterogeneity = 0.27, $I^2 = 17.5\%$). One cross-sectional study presented a positive relation between vegetable intake and wheezing (RR = 1.20; 95%CI, 0.86–1.70).⁹⁰

Meta-analysis of 3 cohorts,^{9,57,63} 2 population-based case-controls,^{68,69} and 4 cross-sectional studies^{76,82,88,97} evaluated intake of fruit in relation to risk of asthma and showed a significant negative association, with an overall RR of 0.77 (95%CI, 0.68-0.87; P for heterogeneity $<0.0001, I^2 = 84.4\%$) for the highest fruit intake compared with the lowest intake. Analysis by study type showed a negative association for the cohort, population-based case-control, and cross-sectional studies (Table 2). In subgroup analysis, an inverse association was also found between apple or citrus fruit consumption and risk of asthma (RR = 0.77; 95%CI, 0.66–0.90; *P* for heterogeneity = 0.02, I^2 = 66.1% and RR = 0.76; 95%CI, 0.56–1.02; P for heterogeneity = 0.013, I^2 = 76.9%, respectively). Metaanalysis from 1 population-based case-control⁶⁹ and 5 cross-sectional^{72,76,82,88,97} studies revealed a negative association between high vegetable intake and risk of asthma

(RR = 0.84; 95%CI, 0.74-0.96; P for heterogeneity < 0.0001, I² = 92.7%).

The associations between fruit and vegetable consumption of mothers during pregnancy and allergic outcomes in their children were investigate. The pooled RR from 4 cohort studies^{59,60,64,66} for fruit and from 4 cohort studies^{60,61,64,66} for vegetables showed that maternal consumption of fruit and vegetables during pregnancy was not associated with risk of wheezing (RR = 0.94; 95%CI, 0.73–1.27; *P* for heterogeneity = 0.02, $I^2 = 70.2\%$ for fruit and RR = 0.91; 95%CI, 0.70-1.18; P for heterogeneity = 0.05, $I^2 = 61.0\%$ for vegetables) or risk of asthma (RR = 0.94; 95%CI, 0.81-1.08; P for heterogeneity = 0.84, $I^2 = 0.0\%$ for fruit and RR = 1.06; 95%CI, 0.72–1.58; *P* for heterogeneity = 0.05, $I^2 = 67.4\%$ for vegetables) in their children. In the pooled analyses of 2 cohorts,^{59,64} high intakes of apples during pregnancy and risk of wheezing in children was also null (RR = 0.84; 95%CI, 0.48–1.46; *P* for heterogeneity = 0.06, $I^2 = 71.8\%$) (Table 2).

Children

Fruit and vegetable intake and risk of wheezing and asthma. The pooled RR from 13 cross-sectional studies^{73,77–81,84–87,90,91,96} and 1 cohort study⁶⁵ conducted for fruit and for 9 cross-sectional studies^{77-79,81,85-87,91,96} and 1 cohort study⁶⁵ conducted for vegetables indicates a significant negative association between high fruit and vegetable intake and risk of childhood wheezing (RR for fruit = 0.81; 95%CI, 0.74–0.88; P for heterogeneity $<0.0001, I^2 = 83.1\%$; and RR for vegetables = 0.88; 95%CI, 0.79–0.97; *P* for heterogeneity <0.0001, $I^2 = 83.7\%$) (Table 2). Again, analyses were pooled separately by children within the end age range of ≤ 11 years old and by others within the first age range of >11 years old.^{70,71,78,80,81,86,87,90-92,96} The reverse association between fruit intake and wheezing was significant for children ≤ 11 years old (RR = 0.83; 95%CI, 0.74–0.93; *P* for heterogeneity <0.001, $I^2 = 72.8\%$) and for children >11 years old (RR = 0.81; 95%CI, 0.72–0.90; *P* for heterogeneity $<0.0001, I^2 = 83.3\%$). The association was weak for vegetables in children ≤11 years old (RR = 0.91; 95%CI, 0.84– 0.99; P for heterogeneity <0.001, $I^2 = 74.1\%$) and in children >11 years old (RR = 0.81; 95%CI, 0.65–1.02; P for heterogeneity <0.0001, $I^2 = 85.9\%$). In subgroup analysis by food, there was a significant negative association between the risk of wheezing and a high intake of citrus fruit and tomatoes (Table 2). A weak negative association was found between risk of asthma and high intake of fruit (RR = 0.90; 95%CI, 0.86–0.94; *P* for heterogeneity = 0.21, $I^2 = 24.5\%$) and vegetables (RR = 0.91; 95%CI, 0.82–1.0; P for heterogeneity <0.0001, $I^2 = 69.2\%$). The significant

inverse association was also found for children >11 years old by fruit (RR = 0.76; 95%CI, 0.65–0.89; *P* for heterogeneity <0.01, I^2 = 64.6%), but not for children ≤11 years old (RR = 0.89; 95%CI, 0.83–0.95; *P* for heterogeneity = 0.88, I^2 = 0.0%), and for children >11 years old by vegetable (RR = 0.92; 95%CI, 0.83–1.02; *P* for heterogeneity <0.003, I^2 = 70.0%) and for children ≤11 years old (RR = 0.86; 95%CI, 0.71–1.04; *P* for heterogeneity <0.004, I^2 = 70.9%). Total fruit and vegetable intake had a statistically significant negative association with risk of asthma in children) (Table 2).

DISCUSSION

This review sought to verify whether fruit and vegetable consumption has a beneficial effect on wheezing and asthma prevention, and if so, which are the most beneficial. The findings show that high intakes of fruits and raw vegetables (most markedly of fruit) are significantly associated with a reduction in the risk of wheezing, while high intake of vegetables had a modest negative association with risk of asthma. This review is unique as it is the first meta-analysis of the relationship between fruit and vegetables and the risk of wheezing and asthma. In a combined analysis of adults and children, individuals in the highest total fruit and vegetable intake category had a 36% lower risk of asthma than individuals in the lowest intake categories. In children, high intake of citrus fruit and tomatoes was negatively associated with the risk of wheezing, and high intake of fruit and vegetables was associated with a reduction in the risk of wheezing and asthma. However, 1 cohort study⁶⁵ and 2 cross-sectional studies^{81,87} showed a positive relationship between high vegetable consumption and asthma, contradicting these results. One study⁶⁶ noted a positive relationship between vegetable intake in pregnant women and the incidence of asthma in their infants. In the subgroup of fruit and vegetables analyses, high intake of citrus fruit and tomatoes was strongly related to the reduction in the risk of wheezing, and there was an inverse association between high intakes of apples and citrus fruit and the risk of asthma. Similarly, 1 study found a strong negative relationship between fruit and vegetable consumption and allergic asthma.⁷⁴ An observational study in Australia also showed that the consumption of apples and pears was negatively associated with risk of asthma and bronchial hyperresponsiveness.⁷⁶ Pooled analysis by Nurmatov et al.⁹⁸ on children aged 10-14 years showed a high intake of fruit but not vegetables reduced the risk of wheezing. The present review showed a negative association between high fruit consumption and risk of wheezing and asthma in children >11 years old and between high fruit consumption and wheezing in children ≤ 11 years old.

The possible protective effects of fruit and vegetables against some types of cancer, heart disease, diabetes, and asthma have been shown in epidemiological studies97,99-101 and may be related to the high content of antioxidants in these foods.¹⁰² Antioxidants play a prominent role in ameliorating oxidative damage caused by free radicals. Flavonoids are a large group of polyphenolic metabolites and are abundant in fruit and vegetables.¹⁰³ In vitro, flavonoids have biological effects such as freeradical scavenging, modulation of enzymatic activity, and inhibition of cellular proliferation. Therefore, they may have potential antibiotic, antiallergic, antidiarrheal, antiulcer, apoptotic, immune-modulatory, and antiinflammatory effects.¹⁰⁴⁻¹⁰⁹ In addition, flavonoids may enhance the activities of endogenous antioxidants; they have been shown to lower oxidative stress by inducing the activity of glutathione S-transferase, an enzyme that may protect cells from oxidative pathologies.¹¹⁰

Because respiratory airways are highly susceptible to oxidative damage, numerous enzymatic and nonenzymatic antioxidant defense mechanisms are present. Antioxidants may decrease airway inflammation by protecting the airways against oxidants from both endogenous and exogenous sources.

The mixtures of polyphenols in foods are often poorly characterized. For instance, tomatoes contain many polyphenols, such as chlorogenic acid and rutin. The skins of red tomatoes contain naringenin chalcones; tomatoes also contain quercetin.¹¹¹ Therefore, investigation of individual food items is warranted.

The present analysis showed a strong negative association between high intake of apples and reduced risk of wheezing and asthma. Lee et al.¹⁶ showed that, among all phenolic phytochemicals in apples, quercetin (the main flavonoid in apples) contributes most to antioxidant activity. Moreover, the vitamin C content of apples provides only 11% of the total antioxidant capacity in apples and compared with vitamin C, flavonoids such as quercetin contribute more to the total antioxidant activity of apples. Because a large proportion of quercetin is in apple peels, consuming apples with skins is recommended.¹⁶

This meta-analysis is not without limitations. The ability to differentiate between food items with respect to association with asthma was limited. Some analyses were based on only two studies, and there are few prospective studies included. The findings, therefore, are based mostly on cross-sectional studies that are relatively quick and easy but do not permit distinction between cause-and-effect associations. As a result, data are prone to subject recalls and interviewer bias.¹¹² There are also some defects in adjusting for confounding and modification of effects, which may have introduced bias to the findings.²⁵ In addition, differing outcome parameters were used in

wheezing and asthma. To prevent bias and to enhance the quality of study, only studies that adjusted for important confounders were included. In addition to the analysis of total adults and children, results were stratified again by study design, range of age in children, and some food items. Moreover, extensive sensitivity analyses were performed by excluding studies that did not meet specific criteria for adjustment or study design. None of these exclusions appreciably changed the overall estimates, which suggests these findings are reliable. High intake of fruit and vegetables was negatively associated with risk of wheezing and asthma in both adults and children. Among the different kinds of vegetables and fruit investigated, citrus fruit and tomatoes displayed the strongest negative association with risk of wheezing, and citrus fruit and apples showed the strongest negative association with risk of asthma.

CONCLUSION

The current study represents a comprehensive systematic review and meta-analysis. The results suggest that a flavonoid-rich diet is negatively associated with wheezing and risk of asthma. Further molecular studies may be necessary to identify possible mechanisms of citrus fruit, apples, and tomatoes in relation to the development of asthma. Moreover, prospective cohort studies with large sample sizes are needed to accurately measure the effects of high fruit and vegetable intake on risk of asthma.

Acknowledgments

Funding. This work was supported by the Tuberculosis and Lung Disease Research Center, Tabriz University of Medical Sciences, Iran.

Declaration of interest. The authors have no relevant interests to declare.

REFERENCES

- McKeever TM, Britton J. Diet and asthma. Am J Respir Crit Care Med. 2004;170:725–729.
- Baines KJ, Simpson JL, Wood LG, et al. Transcriptional phenotypes of asthma defined by gene expression profiling of induced sputum samples. J Allergy Clin Immunol. 2011;127:153–160.e9.
- Kroegel C. Global Initiative for Asthma (GINA) guidelines: 15 years of application. Expert Rev Clin Immunol. 2009;5:239–249.
- von Mutius E. The environmental predictors of allergic disease. J Allergy Clin Immunol. 2000;105(1 Pt 1):9–19.
- Carey OJ, Locke C, Cookson JB. Effect of alterations of dietary sodium on the severity of asthma in men. Thorax. 1993;48:714–718.
- 6. Barros R, Moreira A, Fonseca J, et al. Dietary intake of α -linolenic acid and low ratio of n-6:n-3 PUFA are associated with decreased exhaled NO and improved asthma control. Br J Nutr. 2011;106:441–450.
- Hijazi N, Abalkhail B, Seaton A. Diet and childhood asthma in a society in transition: a study in urban and rural Saudi Arabia. Thorax. 2000;55:775–779.
- Burns JS, Dockery DW, Neas LM, et al. Low dietary nutrient intakes and respiratory health in adolescents. Chest. 2007;132:238–245.

- Knekt P, Kumpulainen J, Jarvinen R, et al. Flavonoid intake and risk of chronic diseases. Am J Clin Nutr. 2002;76:560–568.
- Chen CC, Chow MP, Huang WC, et al. Flavonoids inhibit tumor necrosis factor-α-induced up-regulation of intercellular adhesion molecule-1 (ICAM-1) in respiratory epithelial cells through activator protein-1 and nuclear factor-κB: structure-activity relationships. Mol Pharmacol. 2004;66: 683–693.
- Bondonno CP, Yang X, Croft KD, et al. Flavonoid-rich apples and nitrate-rich spinach augment nitric oxide status and improve endothelial function in healthy men and women: a randomized controlled trial. Free Radic Biol Med. 2012;52:95–102.
- McCullough ML, Peterson JJ, Patel R, et al. Flavonoid intake and cardiovascular disease mortality in a prospective cohort of US adults. Am J Clin Nutr. 2012;95:454–464.
- Hwang SL, Shih PH, Yen GC. Neuroprotective effects of citrus flavonoids. J Agric Food Chem. 2012;60:877–885.
- Tabak C, Arts IC, Smit HA, et al. Chronic obstructive pulmonary disease and intake of catechins, flavonols, and flavones: the MORGEN Study. Am J Respir Crit Care Med. 2001;164:61–64.
- Manach C, Scalbert A, Morand C, et al. Polyphenols: food sources and bioavailability. Am J Clin Nutr. 2004;79:727–747.
- Lee KW, Kim YJ, Kim DO, et al. Major phenolics in apple and their contribution to the total antioxidant capacity. J Agric Food Chem. 2003;51:6516–6520.
- Bharrhan S, Koul A, Chopra K, et al. Catechin suppresses an array of signalling molecules and modulates alcohol-induced endotoxin mediated liver injury in a rat model. PLoS One. 2011;6:e20635. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0020635.
- Park CM, Jin KS, Lee YW, et al. Luteolin and chicoric acid synergistically inhibited inflammatory responses via inactivation of PI3K-Akt pathway and impairment of NF-kappaB translocation in LPS stimulated RAW 264.7 cells. Eur J Pharmacol. 2011;660:454–459.
- Stroup DF, Berlin JA, Morton SC, et al. Meta-analysis of observational studies in epidemiology: a proposal for reporting. Meta-analysis of Observational Studies in Epidemiology (MOOSE) group. JAMA. 2000;283:2008–2012.
- 20. DerSimonian R, Laird N. Meta-analysis in clinical trials. Control Clin Trials. 1986;7:177–188.
- van Houwelingen HC, Arends LR, Stijnen T. Advanced methods in metaanalysis: multivariate approach and meta-regression. Stat Med. 2002;21:589– 624.
- 22. Thompson SG, Higgins JP. How should meta-regression analyses be undertaken and interpreted? Stat Med. 2002;21:1559–1573.
- Egger M, Davey Smith G, Schneider M, et al. Bias in meta-analysis detected by a simple, graphical test. BMJ 1997;315:629–634.
- Higgins JP, Thompson SG. Quantifying heterogeneity in a meta-analysis. Stat Med. 2002;21:1539–1558.
- Nurmatov U, Nwaru BI, Devereux G, et al. Confounding and effect modification in studies of diet and childhood asthma and allergies. Allergy. 2012;67:1041– 1059.
- McKeever TM, Lewis SA, Cassano PA, et al. Patterns of dietary intake and relation to respiratory disease, forced expiratory volume in 1 s, and decline in 5-y forced expiratory volume. Am J Clin Nutr. 2010;92:408–415.
- Hong SJ, Lee MS, Lee SY, et al. High body mass index and dietary pattern are associated with childhood asthma. Pediatr Pulmonol. 2006;41:1118– 1124.
- Butler LM, Koh WP, Lee HP, et al. Prospective study of dietary patterns and persistent cough with phlegm among Chinese Singaporeans. Am J Respir Crit Care Med. 2006;173:264–270.
- Fitzsimon N, Fallon U, O'Mahony D, et al. Mothers' dietary patterns during pregnancy and risk of asthma symptoms in children at 3 years. Ir Med J. 2007;100:27–32.
- de Batlle J, Garcia-Aymerich J, Barraza-Villarreal A, et al. Mediterranean diet is associated with reduced asthma and rhinitis in Mexican children. Allergy. 2008;63:1310–1316.
- Shaheen SO, Northstone K, Newson RB, et al. Dietary patterns in pregnancy and respiratory and atopic outcomes in childhood. Thorax. 2009;64:411– 417.
- 32. Varraso R, Kauffmann F, Leynaert B, et al. Dietary patterns and asthma in the E3N study. Eur Respir J. 2009;33:33–41.
- Hooper R, Heinrich J, Omenaas E, et al. Dietary patterns and risk of asthma: results from three countries in European Community Respiratory Health Survey-II. Br J Nutr. 2010;103:1354–1365.
- 34. Bakolis I, Hooper R, Thompson RL, et al. Dietary patterns and adult asthma: population-based case-control study. Allergy. 2010;65:606–615.
- Miyake Y, Okubo H, Sasaki S, et al. Maternal dietary patterns during pregnancy and risk of wheeze and eczema in Japanese infants aged 16–24 months: the Osaka Maternal and Child Health Study. Pediatr Allergy Immunol. 2011;22:734– 741.
- Lee SC, Yang YH, Chuang SY, et al. Risk of asthma associated with energy-dense but nutrient-poor dietary pattern in Taiwanese children. Asia Pac J Clin Nutr. 2012;21:73–81.

- Castro-Rodriguez JA, Garcia-Marcos L, Alfonseda Rojas JD, et al. Mediterranean diet as a protective factor for wheezing in preschool children. J Pediatr. 2008;152:823–828.e2,
- Arvaniti F, Priftis KN, Papadimitriou A, et al. Adherence to the Mediterranean type of diet is associated with lower prevalence of asthma symptoms, among 10–12 years old children: the PANACEA study. Pediatr Allergy Immunol. 2011;22:283–289.
- Watson RR, Zibadi S, Rafatpanah H, et al. Oral administration of the purple passion fruit peel extract reduces wheeze and cough and improves shortness of breath in adults with asthma. Nutr Res. 2008;28:166–171.
- Wood LG, Garg ML, Powell H, et al. Lycopene-rich treatments modify noneosinophilic airway inflammation in asthma: proof of concept. Free Radic Res. 2008;42:94–102.
- Lee SC, Yang YH, Chuang SY, et al. Reduced medication use and improved pulmonary function with supplements containing vegetable and fruit concentrate, fish oil and probiotics in asthmatic school children: a randomised controlled trial. Br J Nutr. 2012;5:1–11.
- 42. Wood LG, Garg ML, Smart JM, et al. Manipulating antioxidant intake in asthma: a randomized controlled trial. Am J Clin Nutr. 2012;96:534–543.
- Gilliland FD, Berhane KT, Li YF, et al. Children's lung function and antioxidant vitamin, fruit, juice, and vegetable intake. Am J Epidemiol. 2003;158:576– 584.
- Antova T, Pattenden S, Nikiforov B, et al. Nutrition and respiratory health in children in six Central and Eastern European countries. Thorax. 2003;58:231– 236.
- Lewis SA, Antoniak M, Venn AJ, et al. Secondhand smoke, dietary fruit intake, road traffic exposures, and the prevalence of asthma: a cross-sectional study in young children. Am J Epidemiol. 2005;161:406–411.
- Fogarty AW, Antoniak M, Venn AJ, et al. A natural experiment on the impact of fruit supplementation on asthma symptoms in children. Eur Respir J. 2009;33:481–485.
- 47. Cook DG, Carey IM, Whincup PH, et al. Effect of fresh fruit consumption on lung function and wheeze in children. Thorax. 1997;52:628–633.
- Butland BK, Fehily AM, Elwood PC. Diet, lung function, and lung function decline in a cohort of 2512 middle aged men. Thorax. 2000;55:102–108.
- Mai XM, Neuman A, Ostblom E, et al. Symptoms to pollen and fruits early in life and allergic disease at 4 years of age. Allergy. 2008;63:1499–1504.
- Nagel G, Linseisen J. Dietary intake of fatty acids, antioxidants and selected food groups and asthma in adults. Eur J Clin Nutr. 2005;59:8–15.
- Prelip M, Slusser W, Thai CL, et al. Effects of a school-based nutrition program diffused throughout a large urban community on attitudes, beliefs, and behaviors related to fruit and vegetable consumption. J Sch Health. 2011;81:520– 529.
- Bueso AK, Berntsen S, Mowinckel P, et al. Dietary intake in adolescents with asthma – potential for improvement. Pediatr Allergy Immunol. 2011;22(1 Pt 1):19–24.
- Liang W, Chikritzhs T, Lee AH. Lifestyle of young Australian adults with asthma. Asia Pac J Public Health 2012; doi: 1010539512439229.
- Li J, Huang Y, Lin X, et al. Factors associated with allergen sensitizations in patients with asthma and/or rhinitis in China. Am J Rhinol Allergy 2012;26:85– 91.
- Nwaru BI, Ahonen S, Kaila M, et al. Maternal diet during pregnancy and allergic sensitization in the offspring by 5 yrs of age: a prospective cohort study. Pediatr Allergy Immunol. 2010;21(1 Pt 1):29–37.
- Heinrich JFHB, Holscher BFBG, Bolte GFWG, et al. Allergic sensitization and diet: ecological analysis in selected European cities. Eur Respir J. 2001;17:395–402.
- Miedema I, Feskens EJ, Heederik D, et al. Dietary determinants of long-term incidence of chronic nonspecific lung diseases. The Zutphen Study. Am J Epidemiol. 1993;138:37–45.
- Butland BK, Strachan DP, Anderson HR. Fresh fruit intake and asthma symptoms in young British adults: confounding or effect modification by smoking? Eur Respir J. 1999;13:744–750.
- Willers SM, Devereux G, Craig LC, et al. Maternal food consumption during pregnancy and asthma, respiratory and atopic symptoms in 5-year-old children. Thorax. 2007;62:773–779.
- Willers SM, Wijga AH, Brunekreef B, et al. Maternal food consumption during pregnancy and the longitudinal development of childhood asthma. Am J Respir Crit Care Med. 2008;178:124–131.
- Chatzi L, Torrent M, Romieu I, et al. Mediterranean diet in pregnancy is protective for wheeze and atopy in childhood. Thorax. 2008;63:507–513.
- Bacopoulou F, Veltsista A, Vassi I, et al. Can we be optimistic about asthma in childhood? A Greek cohort study. J Asthma. 2009;46:171–174.
- Uddenfeldt M, Janson C, Lampa E, et al. High BMI is related to higher incidence of asthma, while a fish and fruit diet is related to a lower – Results from a long-term follow-up study of three age groups in Sweden. Respir Med. 2010;104:972–980.
- Miyake Y, Sasaki S, Tanaka K, et al. Consumption of vegetables, fruit, and antioxidants during pregnancy and wheeze and eczema in infants. Allergy. 2010;65:758–765.

- Willers SM, Wijga AH, Brunekreef B, et al. Childhood diet and asthma and atopy at 8 years of age: the PIAMA birth cohort study. Eur Respir J. 2011;37:1060– 1067.
- Erkkola M, Nwaru BI, Kaila M, et al. Risk of asthma and allergic outcomes in the offspring in relation to maternal food consumption during pregnancy: a Finnish birth cohort study. Pediatr Allergy Immunol. 2012;23:186–194.
- Protudjer JL, Sevenhuysen GP, Ramsey CD, et al. Low vegetable intake is associated with allergic asthma and moderate-to-severe airway hyperresponsiveness. Pediatr Pulmonol. 2012;47:1159–1169.
- Shaheen SO, Sterne JA, Thompson RL, et al. Dietary antioxidants and asthma in adults: population-based case-control study. Am J Respir Crit Care Med. 2001;164(10 Pt 1):1823–1828.
- Patel BD, Welch AA, Bingham SA, et al. Dietary antioxidants and asthma in adults. Thorax. 2006;61:388–393.
- Pastorino AC, Rimazza RD, Leone C, et al. Risk factors for asthma in adolescents in a large urban region of Brazil. J Asthma. 2006;43:695–700.
- 71. Mendes AP, Zhang L, Prietsch SO, et al. Factors associated with asthma severity in children: a case-control study. J Asthma. 2011;48:235–240.
- La Vecchia C, Decarli A, Pagano R. Vegetable consumption and risk of chronic disease. Epidemiology. 1998;9:208–210.
- 73. Forastiere F, Pistelli R, Sestini P, et al. Consumption of fresh fruit rich in vitamin C and wheezing symptoms in children. Thorax. 2000;55:283–288.
- Priftanji AV, Qirko E, Burr ML, et al. Factors associated with asthma in Albania. Allergy. 2002;57:123–128.
- Ushiyama Y, Matsumoto K, Shinohara M, et al. Nutrition during pregnancy may be associated with allergic diseases in infants. J Nutr Sci Vitaminol 2002;48:345– 351.
- Woods RK, Walters EH, Raven JM, et al. Food and nutrient intakes and asthma risk in young adults. Am J Clin Nutr. 2003;78:414–421.
- 77. Farchi S, Forastiere F, Agabiti N, et al. Dietary factors associated with wheezing and allergic rhinitis in children. Eur Respir J. 2003;22:772–780.
- Awasthi S, Kalra E, Roy S. Prevalence and risk factors of asthma and wheeze in school-going children in Lucknow, North India. Indian Pediatr. 2004;41:1205– 1210.
- Wong GW, Ko FW, Hui DS, et al. Factors associated with difference in prevalence of asthma in children from three cities in China: multicentre epidemiological survey. BMJ. 2004;329:486. doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.1136/bmj.329.7464 .486.
- Nja F, Nystad W, Lodrup Carlsen KC, et al. Effects of early intake of fruit or vegetables in relation to later asthma and allergic sensitization in school-age children. Acta Paediatr. 2005;94:147–154.
- Tabak C, Wijga AH, de Meer G, et al. Diet and asthma in Dutch school children (ISAAC-2). Thorax. 2006;61:1048–1053.
- Romieu I, Varraso R, Avenel V, et al. Fruit and vegetable intakes and asthma in the E3N study. Thorax. 2006;61:209–215.
- Garcia-Marcos L, Canflanca IM, Garrido JB, et al. Relationship of asthma and rhinoconjunctivitis with obesity, exercise and Mediterranean diet in Spanish schoolchildren. Thorax. 2007;62:503–508.
- Okoko BJ, Burney PG, Newson RB, et al. Childhood asthma and fruit consumption. Eur Respir J. 2007;29:1161–1168.
- Chatzi L, Torrent M, Romieu I, et al. Diet, wheeze, and atopy in school children in Menorca, Spain. Pediatr Allergy Immunol. 2007;18:480–485.
- Chatzi L, Apostolaki G, Bibakis I, et al. Protective effect of fruits, vegetables and the Mediterranean diet on asthma and allergies among children in Crete. Thorax. 2007;62:677–683.
- 87. Tsai HJ, Tsai AC. The association of diet with respiratory symptoms and asthma in schoolchildren in Taipei, Taiwan. J Asthma. 2007;44:599–603.
- Barros R, Moreira A, Fonseca J, et al. Adherence to the Mediterranean diet and fresh fruit intake are associated with improved asthma control. Allergy. 2008;63:917–923.
- Garcia E, Aristizabal G, Vasquez C, et al. Prevalence of and factors associated with current asthma symptoms in school children aged 6–7 and 13–14 yr old in Bogota, Colombia. Pediatr Allergy Immunol. 2008;19:307–314.
- Takaoka M, Norback D. Diet among Japanese female university students and asthmatic symptoms, infections, pollen and furry pet allergy. Respir Med. 2008;102:1045–1054.
- Nagel G, Weinmayr G, Kleiner A, et al. Effect of diet on asthma and allergic sensitisation in the International Study on Allergies and Asthma in Childhood (ISAAC) Phase Two. Thorax. 2010;65:516–522.
- Lawson JA, Janssen I, Bruner MW, et al. Urban-rural differences in asthma prevalence among young people in Canada: the roles of health behaviors and obesity. Ann Allergy Asthma Immunol. 2011;107:220–228.
- Rosenlund H, Kull I, Pershagen G, et al. Fruit and vegetable consumption in relation to allergy: disease-related modification of consumption? J Allergy Clin Immunol. 2011;127:1219–1225.
- Nakamura K, Wada K, Sahashi Y, et al. Associations of intake of antioxidant vitamins and fatty acids with asthma in pre-school children. Public Health Nutr. 2012;1:1–6.

- Rosenkranz RR, Rosenkranz SK, Neessen KJ. Dietary factors associated with lifetime asthma or hayfever diagnosis in Australian middle-aged and older adults: a cross-sectional study. Nutr J. 2012;11:1475–2891.
- Ellwood P, Innes Asher M, García-Marcos L, et al. Do fast foods cause asthma, rhinoconjunctivitis and eczema? Global findings from the International Study of Asthma and Allergies in Childhood (ISAAC) Phase Three. Thorax. 2013;68:351–360.
- Agrawal S, Pearce N, Ebrahim S. Prevalence and risk factors for self-reported asthma in an adult Indian population: a cross-sectional survey. Int J Tuberc Lung Dis. 2013;17:275–282. doi: 210.5588/ijtld.5512.0438.
- Nurmatov U, Devereux G, Sheikh A. Nutrients and foods for the primary prevention of asthma and allergy: systematic review and meta-analysis. J Allergy Clin Immunol. 2011;127:724–733 e.30.
- Martinez-Gonzalez MA, de la Fuente-Arrillaga C, Lopez-Del-Burgo C, et al. Low consumption of fruit and vegetables and risk of chronic disease: a review of the epidemiological evidence and temporal trends among Spanish graduates. Public Health Nutr. 2011;14:2309–2315.
- Freak-Poli R, Wolfe R, Backholer K, et al. Impact of a pedometer-based workplace health program on cardiovascular and diabetes risk profile. Prev Med. 2011;53:162–171.
- Kapiszewska M. A vegetable to meat consumption ratio as a relevant factor determining cancer preventive diet. The Mediterranean versus other European countries. Forum Nutr. 2006;59:130–153.
- Proteggente AR, Pannala AS, Paganga G, et al. The antioxidant activity of regularly consumed fruit and vegetables reflects their phenolic and vitamin C composition. Free Radic Res. 2002;36:217–233.

- Hertog MGL, Hollman PCH, Katan MB. Content of potentially anticarcinogenic flavonoids of 28 vegetables and 9 fruits commonly consumed in the Netherlands. J Agric Food Chemi. 1992;40:2379–2383.
- Moraes Tde M, Rodrigues CM, Kushima H, et al. Hancornia speciosa: indications of gastroprotective, healing and anti-Helicobacter pylori actions. J Ethnopharmacol. 2008;120:161–168.
- Nwafor PA, Bassey AI. Evaluation of anti-diarrhoeal and anti-ulcerogenic potential of ethanol extract of *Carpolobia lutea* leaves in rodents. J Ethnopharmacol. 2007;111:619–624.
- Middleton E, Jr, Kandaswami C. Effects of flavonoids on immune and inflammatory cell functions. Biochem Pharmacol. 1992;43:1167–1179.
- Fresco P, Borges F, Marques MP, et al. The anticancer properties of dietary polyphenols and its relation with apoptosis. Curr Pharm Des. 2010;16:114– 134.
- Jacquemin G, Shirley S, Micheau O. Combining naturally occurring polyphenols with TNF-related apoptosis-inducing ligand: a promising approach to kill resistant cancer cells? Cell Mol Life Sci. 2010;67:3115–3130.
- Yao H, Xu W, Shi X, et al. Dietary flavonoids as cancer prevention agents. J Environ Sci Health C Environ Carcinog Ecotoxicol Rev. 2011;29:1–31.
- 110. Dixon DP, Skipsey M, Edwards R. Roles for glutathione transferases in plant secondary metabolism. Phytochemistry. 2010;71:338–350.
- 111. Iwamura C, Shinoda K, Yoshimura M, et al. Naringenin chalcone suppresses allergic asthma by inhibiting the type-2 function of CD4 T cells. Allergol Int. 2010;59:67–73.
- 112. Mann CJ. Observational research methods. Research design II: cohort, cross sectional, and case-control studies. Emerg Med J. 2003;20:54–60.